

A NEW KIND OF WILD Thinking About the Future of Restoration in the Gulf of Mexico February 6, 2019



\* Slides represent my personal views.



#### The Gulf of Mexico is Really Cool, (too)

- Ninth largest body of water in the world (NOAA 2011)
- Drains 20 major river systems:
   3.8 million km<sup>2</sup>
- Over 15,000 marine species
- Gulf States: GDP \$3 Trillion in 2016 (BEA 2017)



National Geographic Society

## **Stressors & Challenges**

- Chronic & acute loss of critical habitats, including wetlands & barriers
- Water quality degradation, including the annual appearance of a hypoxic dead zone (size of New Jersey in 2017)
- Invasive species
- Alteration of hydrology
- Hurricanes and storms
- Climate Change
- Impacts from DWH

= Compounded
vulnerability, Billions of
\$ of infrastructure,
habitats and human
communities at risk



Old Shell Road in Mobile, AL (USA Archives)



RISE OF 'SHORELINE HARDENING' THREATENS COASTAL ECOSYSTEMS

April 1.217 Convenient No. Rod / P.Conner

The United Statist is covering its coacts in armor. "Showine hardening," which notes its the process of adding structures such as seawalls of pillers, has become increasingly projeke over the part century. It a new study, researchers estimate that more than 14,000 miles at UD ceasible have been transformed in the way. — and the changes could spell totable for accounting that back transformed in the way. — and the changes could spell totable for accounting and cause halofasts such as attempted presentation for species, and they can increase estimate and cause halofasts such as attempted and section to structure.

# Impacts from the Deepwater Horizon Spill



-- Deepwater Horizon Natural Resource Damage Assessment (NRDA) Trustees

- 1300 miles of shoreline oiled
- Plant cover and vegetation mass reduced along 350 to 720 miles of shoreline
- Amphipods, periwinkles, shrimp, forage fish, red drum, fiddler crabs, insects mortality
- 4 8.3 billion harvestable oysters lost
- Mortality of between 51,000 to 84,000 birds
- Mortality of between 56,000 to 166,000 small juvenile sea turtles
- Up to 51% decrease in Barataria Bay dolphin population
- An estimated 2 5 trillion newly hatched fish were killed



### What Would You Do With \$20 Billion?

- Natural Resource Damage Assessment: \$8.1 Billion
- ✤ RESTORE Act: \$5.3 Billion
- National Fish and Wildlife Foundation GEBF: \$2.5 Billion
- National Academy of Sciences: \$500 Million
- North American Wetlands
   Conservation Fund: \$100 million



Ocean Conservancy



# Where Are We Headed? Climate Change in the GOM

- Relative Sea Level Rise
- Habitat Loss/Erosion (e.g. marsh conversion to open water)
- Changes in Water Availability and Flow
- Coastal Storms
- Changes in Biodiversity, Ecosystem Composition, and Species Invasion/Shifts in Composition (e.g. marsh to mangrove)





# **Advancing Restoration Under Complex Conditions**

Creating favorable conditions for restoration to succeed:

- The past is no longer prologue.
- Sound governance structures are critical and should consider new, integrated approaches to planning, implementation and monitoring.
- High-impact investments are key.
- We need adequate data and information on which to base the case for investments, while recognizing that uncertainty is a reality.



### The Past Isn't Prologue

- Traditional approaches will likely be inadequate given the scale and severity of changes to ecosystem form and function in the coming century.
- New approaches will acknowledge that change is inevitable, and recognize that the landscape is fluid. (Manning et al., 2009).
- What is achievable? Focus project planning, prioritization and goal-setting based on a basic understanding of what we know about future conditions: "Achievable Future Conditions" (Golladay et al., 2016)
- Anticipatory Restoration: Activities designed to create "certain conditions in anticipation of further changes in the future" (Manning et al., 2009)







#### Promote Sound, Interdisciplinary Governance Structures, Take Innovative Approaches

- String everyone to the same table, then connect theories and concepts to prioritization, implementation and monitoring (translational ecology) (see Enquist et al., 2017).
- Consider future conditions/impacts of activities.
- Take an open-ended approach to goal-setting that focuses on, e.g. enhancing natural processes, increasing habitat connectivity. (See: Reguero et al., 2018, Enwright et al., 2016)

Design monitoring to focus on change over time as a result of activities rather than a set of numeric benchmarks that may or may not



#### THE ANNERATION PETER.

The poology of the dolts of the Mississippi is no interacting local study. The effect of the withholding by the levens from the great areas of the delta of the accord excitilizations of sed antery matters, and the stanly, though show, sold head arread, is sear which should be taken into according to should ng the important question of how to protect the people from the est waters of the river. No doubt the great bought of and two or three fillewing generations averaging do avoidents of almostateDy patchenting lativale, wa for automorphy the dissilencetoper ha future generations from the autoideous of the Galf dails lands below the lavel of the sea and their gradent abandonsenst due to this come. While it would he generally conversal that the present percent arithm, yet it is sain to say then the development of the date compare shallow the imposized, one tarry by a fully pair codem, al a balancer cost to the expansion address and the Foder and, will be so measurable that seemis of the whell United Statue can well offerd, when the time ris doctive leves against the Unif walasts, as the city of New Orma has shown on a small make against the son waters of Lake aire, and so Hoffsand has done for on larget to do on a still larger scale, in remoting the sea water its in the great projected rechargedian of namped by the Engelser Les. My Eads once sold, its an elongue messile on the subject of the Insportation of the Mindosippi size and the studia channels to the see ; " This glass strenge, with it and and its A settion and an and another setting half a rescomparison way to the availary Gall through hands as fortile that homan impossibly is courtaged to harvest their productives has been given by its frameettal Architect late the jealous keeps of this Republic

HE ANNEXATION PENER.



# High Impact Investments Are Key

- What constitutes high impact?
  - Large-scale projects?
  - Projects with long design-lives?
  - Projects that result in measurable change to ecosystem form or function, regardless of size?
  - Projects that reduce or mitigate future risk?
  - Projects that address a current critical need (e.g. wetlands in restoration)
- How should we (scientists, community, decision-makers) prioritize?
- Short-term vs long-term goals and objectives...
- Are there some places that shouldn't be "restored"?

- Lessons from the Gulf of Mexico
  - RESTORE Act Priority Criteria
  - Regulatory efficiencies (can we find them?)



# **Gaining Adequate Information**

- What data is most critical to collect?
- What can we do with the information we have, learning and innovating as we go?
- Use Conceptual Models: general and sitespecific
- Conduct Adaptive Management at the project and program levels Lessons from the Gulf of Mexico
  - Baseline data is important.
  - What data is most important to integrate/ synthesize?
  - How to infuse science into inherently complex political constructs?





Mississippi River Meander Belt, Harold Fisk, 1944.

# Putting It All Together...



- Change is inevitable, but we can get more comfortable with uncertainty and manage it through use of conceptual models, focused data collection and adaptive management.
- Translational Ecology is a must– develop story lines and approaches from problem definition through to results.
- Decisions will be made and money will be spent...it's up to us to make the case to spend it on projects that provide benefits to both natural and human communities.
- Shift from a focus on replicating/maintaining historic conditions to facilitating ecosystem processes that support a large-scale approach and a recognition of the dynamic nature of the coast and the people/critters



#### Thank You! Questions?

Bethany Carl Kraft Volkert, Inc. <u>Bethany.Kraft@Volkert.com</u>

@Bethanykraft on the Twitter







#### References



-Bureau of Economic Analysis (2017) Gross Domestic Product by State, 4th Quarter and Annual 2016. https://apps.bea.gov/regional/histdata/releases/0517gdpstate/index.cfm

-Deepwater Horizon Oil Spill Trustees (2016). Final Programmatic Damage Assessment and Restoration Plan (PDARP) and Final Programmatic Environmental Impact Statement (PEIS). <a href="http://www.gulfspillrestoration.noaa.gov/restoration-planning/gulf-plan">http://www.gulfspillrestoration.noaa.gov/restoration-planning/gulf-plan</a>

-Enquist, C. A. F., Jackson, S. T., Garfin, G. M., Davis, F. W., Gerber, L. R., Littell, J. A., Shaw, M. R. (2017). Foundations of translational ecology. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment*, *15*(10), 541-550. DOI: 10.1002/fee.173

-Enwright NM, Griffith KT, Osland MJ (2016) Barriers to and opportunities for landward migration of coastal wetland with sea-level rise. Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment 14:307-316

-Golladay, S., Martin, K., Vose, J., Wear, D., Covich, A., Hobbs, R., Shearer, A. (2016). Achievable future conditions as a framework for guiding forest conservation and management. *Forest Ecology and Management*, *360*, 80-96. doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2015.10.009

-Gulf Coast Ecosystem Restoration Task Force. (2011) Gulf of Mexico Regional Ecosystem Restoration Strategy. 132pp. Final Report. <u>http://www.epa.gov/gulfcoasttaskforce/pdfs/GulfCoastReport\_Full\_12-04\_508-1.pdf</u>

-Hughes, F. M., Stroh, P. A., Adams, W. M., Kirby, K. J., Mountford, J. O., & Warrington, S. (2011). Monitoring and evaluating large-scale, 'open-ended' habitat creation projects: A journey rather than a destination. *Journal for Nature Conservation*, *19*(4), 245-253. doi:10.1016/j.jnc.2011.02.003

-Jentsch, A. (2007). The challenge to restore processes in face of nonlinear dynamics on the crucial role of disturbance regimes. Restoration Ecology, 15, 334–339.lobal change. Journal of Biogeography, 36, 193–199.

-Manning, A. D., Fischer, J., Felton, A., Newell, B., Steffen, W., & Lindenmayer, D. B. (2009). Landscape fluidity - a unifying perspective for understanding and adapting to global change. *Journal of Biogeography*, *36*(2), 193-199. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2699.2008.02026

-National Ocean Service, NOAA (2011) The Gulf of Mexico at a Glance: A second glance. U.S. Department of Commerce, Washington, D.C.

-Pendleton EA, Barras JA, Williams SJ, Twichell DC (2010) Coastal vulnerability of the northern Gulf of Mexico to sea-level rise and coastal change. US Geological Survey Open-File Report 2010-1146. United States Geological Survey, Department of the Interior, Washington D.C.

-Polasky S, Carpenter SR, Folke C, Keeler B (2011) Decision-making under great uncertainty: environmental management in an era of global change. Trends in Ecology and Evolution 26:398-404

-Reguero, BG, Beck MW, Bresch, DN, Calil, J, Meliane, I 2018. Comparing the cost effectiveness of nature-based and coastal adaptation: A case study from the Gulf Coast of the United States. PLoS ONE 13(4):e0192132. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0192132

-Sapkota, R.P., Stahl, P.D., Rijal, K. (2018). Restoration Governance: An Integrated Approach towards Sustainably Restoring Degraded Ecosystems. *Environmental*